

MINUTES OF THE LANDMARKS BOARD

DATE: February 9, 2022

TIME: 5:30pm

The meeting and public hearing of the Landmarks Board was held on the above date and time via zoom and in person in the 2 West Conference Room, Busch Building.

Staff members: Michael Sparlin, Senior Planner and Kyle Tolbert, Assistant Attorney.

ROLL CALL:

Landmarks Board members: Kaitlyn McConnell (Chair), Layne Hunton (Vice-Chair), Paul Lewis, Adam Letterman, John Hawkins, Jan Preston, and Bryan Lenox. Absent: Kent Brown.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: Minutes of January 12, 2022, were approved.

NEW BUSINESS:

Certificate of Appropriateness:

Board Action:

Bryan Lenox motioned to **remove** Certificate of Appropriateness of 300-308 West Commercial Street from the table (January 12, 2022, meeting). Jan Preston seconded. The motion carried as follows: Ayes: Kaitlyn McConnell (Chair), Layne Hunton (Vice-Chair), Paul Lewis, Adam Letterman, Jan Preston, Bryan Lenox, and John Hawkins. Nays: None. Abstain: None. Absent: Kent Brown.

300-308 West Commercial Street – Eric Albers representing the owner and want to improve the decorative nature of the building by painting (red lime wash/paint) the brick façade, He states there is a lot of variety to the existing paint and unsightly colors and would like to repaint these areas with a breathable paint. Noted the areas of concern with the existing façade treatment. Also, adding a mural to the east side which would give this area new life and a destination mural for Commercial Street. The awnings on the front with signage are sustainable system similar to fabric. Looking do some non-invasive with the eyebrow mural panels and flower boxes on the upper story of the building to help add more architecture to the building.

Mr. Layne Hunton asked about the red lime wash on the façade.

Mr. Albers noted that it is part of the color scheme and will remove paint that is flaking.

Ms. Kaitlyn McConnell opened the public hearing.

Mr. Paden Chambers 1643 E. Lombard, stated he served on the Board, noted several concerns that are not supported by the newly adopted Commercial Street Design Guidelines - one is not to obscure the original façade, when possible, respect the original characters and do not copy or create decorative elements to be applied to buildings. The building was constructed in 1909 and has a lot of decorative features, including the stone heads on the upper floor, and creating a false since of history is not recommended by the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. Putting the arch heads over existing windows does not make sense and understand that this is noninvasive, but he has concerns that if this was approve, it puts into question why we adopted the Design Guidelines in the first place. The district pays for regular landscaping and have concerns placing false decorative flowers/planters on the building. With regard to the proposed mural – some Board members will recall a mural that was approve a few years ago, thinks that that mural was done well and took into account the narrowness of the alley. The proposal mural is large, and the alley is approximately 15' wide and you will only be able to see a small portion (north/south ends) and concerned may be lost. Commercial Street and the City put a survey looked into public artwork and how this piece of artwork relates to the survey.

Ms. Kaitlyn McConnell closed the public hearing.

Mr. Layne Hunton states that the red lime wash is appropriate and has been done in the past. The awnings fit with the recommendations of the Commercial Street Design Guidelines. We have denied flower boxes in the past. Echoing Paden's comments this does not make sense architecturally or historically and the way the building was built. Believes the color scheme (top of building) looks good, but due to past decisions cannot get behind the decision for those changes. As for the mural, he states he's concerned that the intricate brickwork would be lost and is worthy of more discussion.

Ms. McConnell agrees with Layne's opinion and asks how murals are handled and asks if it's the Board's discretion.

Mr. Sparlin noted that paint is discouraged on unpainted brick, but the mural has been an interesting issue for the Board, because it is there to enhance the district, but the other concern is the breathability of the paint. The mural that the Board approved was much smaller and contained and the Board has expressed concern that some murals could obscure architectural detail of the building. It is the Board's discretion

Ms. McConnell asked about voting on these alterations separately for the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Mr. Sparlin noted that the Landmarks Board can vote separately on the proposed alterations.

Mr. Tolbert noted that the code allows the Board to add specific conditions to the approval.

Ms. McConnell asked about mineral paint and its breathability.

Mr. Albers noted that it is a type of paint that allows the brick to be breathable.

Mr. Bryan Lennox likes the rendering of the drawings, but we are here to preserve the historic nature of the building and what agrees with Layne on all of his points and the mural looks great but this building has intricate brickwork and could it be done in a different way that brings to brickwork out.

Mr. Paul Lewis noted that he agrees with the other board members and his problem is with the mural based on historical elements and agrees that you won't get the full perspective of the mural.

Mr. Hunton states if there was proposed mural that fit within the "bays" in between the brick is proud or somewhere limited where the building is the focus that would be better.

Ms. McConnell noted that the mural detracts from the historical value of the building in that you lose the brickyard and competes with the street.

Ms. McConnell talked about breaking up the actions/motions on each element.

Board Action #1: Motion Failed

John Hawkins motioned to approve the Mural on the Certificate of Appropriateness (300-308 West Commercial Street). Jan Preston Lenox seconded the motion. The motion carried as follows: Ayes: None. Nays: Kaitlyn McConnell (Chair), Layne Hunton (Vice-Chair), Paul Lewis, Adam Letterman, Jan Preston, Bryan Lenox, and John Hawkins. Abstain: None. Absent: Kent Brown.

Board Action #2: Motion Approved

John Hawkins motioned to approve the Awnings on the Certificate of Appropriateness (300-308 West Commercial Street). Bryan Lenox seconded the motion. The motion carried as follows: Ayes: Kaitlyn McConnell (Chair), Layne Hunton (Vice-Chair), Paul Lewis, Adam Letterman, Jan Preston, Bryan Lenox, and John Hawkins. Nays: None. Abstain: None. Absent: Kent Brown.

Board Action #3: Motion Failed

John Hawkins motioned to approve the Eyebrow Mural Panels and Flower Boxes on the Certificate of Appropriateness (300-308 West Commercial Street). Jan Preston seconded the motion. The motion carried as follows: Ayes: None. Nays:

Kaitlyn McConnell (Chair), Layne Hunton (Vice-Chair), Paul Lewis, Adam Letterman, Jan Preston, Bryan Lenox, and John Hawkins. Abstain: None. Absent: Kent Brown.

Board Action #4: Motion Approved

Layne Hunton motioned to approve the Red Lime Wash (north and west sides) on the Certificate of Appropriateness (300-308 West Commercial Street). Bryan Lenox seconded the motion. The motion carried as follows: Ayes: Kaitlyn McConnell (Chair), Layne Hunton (Vice-Chair), Paul Lewis, Adam Letterman, Jan Preston, Bryan Lenox, and John Hawkins. Nays: None. Abstain: None. Absent: Kent Brown.

Board Action #5: Motion Failed

John Hawkins motioned to approve the Painting on Front Façade of the Decorative Brick (top of building) on the Certificate of Appropriateness (300-308 West Commercial Street). Jan Preston seconded the motion. The motion carried as follows: Ayes: Kaitlyn McConnell (Chair) and Jan Preston. Nays: Layne Hunton (Vice-Chair), Paul Lewis, Adam Letterman, Bryan Lenox, and John Hawkins. Abstain: None. Absent: Kent Brown.

Board Action #6: Motion Approved

Layne Hunton motioned to approve the Painting on Lower North Face of Building (previously painted) on the Certificate of Appropriateness (300-308 West Commercial Street). John Hawkins seconded the motion. The motion carried as follows: Ayes: Kaitlyn McConnell (Chair), Layne Hunton (Vice-Chair), Paul Lewis, Adam Letterman, Jan Preston, Bryan Lenox, and John Hawkins. Nays: None. Abstain: None. Absent: Kent Brown.

Mr. Kyle Tolbert suggests clarifying the Certificate of Appropriateness to show a vote subject to the previous motions.

John Hawkins motioned to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness as to elements that the Landmarks Board has approved at this meeting on the Certificate of Appropriateness (300-308 West Commercial Street). Adam Letterman seconded the motion. The motion carried as follows: Ayes: Kaitlyn McConnell (Chair), Layne Hunton (Vice-Chair), Paul Lewis, Adam Letterman, Jan Preston, Bryan Lenox, and John Hawkins. Nays: None. Abstain: None. Absent: Kent Brown.

Local Historic Site Nomination Review:

836 South Delaware Avenue – Mr. Michael Sparlin noted that they are working on getting more information on the nomination and asked to be postponed for the March 9, 2022, meeting.

Board Action:

Bryan Lenox motioned to postpone the Historic Site Nomination (836 South Delaware). Jan Preston seconded the motion. The motion carried as follows: Ayes: Kaitlyn McConnell (Chair), Layne Hunton (Vice-Chair), Paul Lewis, Adam Letterman, Jan Preston, Bryan Lenox, and John Hawkins. Nays: None. Abstain: None. Absent: Kent Brown.

COMMUNICATIONS: Mr. Michael Sparlin noted that he had received a call from the owners of 920 E. Walnut Street and they are planning on to renovate (fire destruction) and will apply with the Board in a few months.

Ms. Kaitlyn McConnell left the meeting and Layne Hunton will be presiding.

REPORTS:

Report on Committees: None

Application: None

Demolition: None

Historic Site and Districts

Jefferson Avenue Footbridge: Mr. John Hawkins drafted a letter for City Council and gave a draft for the Landmarks Board members to review.

Landmarks Board members expressed their approval of the letter.

Board Action:

Bryan Lenox motioned to approve the Letter to the City Council (Jefferson Avenue Footbridge) and forward to the City Council. Jan Preston seconded the motion. The motion carried as follows: Ayes Layne Hunton (Vice-Chair), Paul Lewis, Adam Letterman, Jan Preston, Bryan Lenox, and John Hawkins. Nays: None. Abstain: None. Absent: Kent Brown.

Potential Local Nomination: None

Administrative approval of C of A's: None

Any other matters that fall under the jurisdiction of the Board: Mr. Paul Lewis expressed his concern for demolition of buildings 50+ years noting the demolition of the residence of Sunshine/National.

ADJOURNMENT:

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 6:30pm.

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Michael Sparlin". The signature is written in dark ink and is positioned above a horizontal line.

Michael Sparlin, Senior Planner