

MINUTES OF THE LANDMARKS BOARD

DATE: December 11, 2019

TIME: 5:30pm

The regular meeting and public hearing of the Landmarks Board was held on the above date and time in City Council Chambers, third floor of Historic City Hall.

Landmarks Board members: Paden Chambers (Chair), Richard Crabtree (Vice Chair), Kent Brown, Paul Lewis, and Kaitlyn McConnell. Absent: Layne Hunton

Staff members: Michael Sparlin, Planning Manager and Tom Rykowski, Assistant Attorney.

ROLL CALL:

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: Approval of November 6, 2019 minutes tabled to January 8, 2020.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS:

Certificate of Appropriateness:

320 E. Commercial Street: Karen Schaefer, 7328 Farm Road 1182, Verona MO, provided another and better product for the proposed mural. She stated that she had received additional information from Beeck Mineral Paints that is ideal for historic structures that bonds to the façade areas with synthetic resin.

Paden Chambers asked about any removing techniques.

Ms. Schaefer noted a vapor blasting or dry-ice technique.

Paden Chambers stated that considerations need to be made of how a mural might be removed in the future.

Paden Chambers noted the Board's appreciation for the additional research. He stated he was conflicted on this issue because the paint appears to be a good product but the guidelines are clear on this issue.

Richard Crabtree noted that the research of the product and it was everything that the Board asked.

Kent Brown motioned to **approve** the Certificate of Appropriateness (320 E. Commercial Street). Paul Lewis seconded the motion. The motion carried as follows: Ayes: Paden Chambers (Chair), Richard Crabtree (Vice Chair), Kaitlyn McConnell, Kent Brown, and Paul Lewis. Nays: None. Abstain: None. Absent: Layne Hunton.

NEW BUSINESS:

Certificate of Appropriateness:

312 E. Commercial Street: Stacey Schneider 312 East Commercial, want to replace approximately 7 windows with wood clad that will be manufactured to match the current windows.

Rob Foster, 1175 N. Pine Street, representing the owner and replacing the windows and will reuse molding and other items to replicate the current windows.

Board Action

Richard Crabtree motioned to **approve** the Certificate of Appropriateness (312 E. Commercial Street). Kent Brown seconded the motion. The motion carried as follows: Ayes: Paden Chambers (Chair), Richard Crabtree (Vice Chair), Kaitlyn McConnell, Kent Brown, and Paul Lewis. Nays: None. Abstain: None. Absent: Layne Hunton.

Certificate of Appropriateness

536 E. Tampa Street: Pastor Jack Cormack, Marshfield reviewed the history of the church and noted the current deterioration (concrete steps/roof/facia/bricks) of the building and with some of the living spaces that are closed as well as the lack of

accessibility, low number of current church membership (29) with limited financial resources and an aging congregation. He stated that the church is a family, not the building. The congregation has voted to leave the building and have received an offer from SMC Electric, which needs to expand. SMC is willing to work with church members to make the transition easier and will be placing a plaque/marker on the site to commemorate the church. They are in talks with the church to possibly salvage items that may be recycled instead of just being completely demolished.

Richard Crabtree stated that he has done significant research and noted that the church has a few fires several times calling it a "Phoenix rising" and stated that the church in the past has hosted a lot of different functions/lectures, etc. and is one of the few African American Churches in Springfield and hopes that the building can be repurposed or resold for another use (housing/office/video studio, etc.) instead of being demolished. He also stated that he believes the church should seek a different buyer who will not demolish it as it was placed on Springfield's charter as a historical building on October 24, 1977 in order to protect it, noting that repairs/updates can be done and cannot vote for it to be demolished/torn down.

Pastor Jack Cormack noted that several outside entities have looked at the church and all have stated that the repairs would be prohibitive, lack of accessibility and on-site parking and stated that the church had a Commercial Real Estate Appraiser value the church.

Richard Crabtree noted that the church needs to contact a Commercial Realtor, not an appraiser who can give a value of what the building can sell for, however a Commercial Realtor can give an appropriate value and who can advertise and get different opinions. He noted Drury College saved a church and Timmons Temple were saved and stated about getting a commercial realtor in order to save it.

Paden Chambers stated that he agreed with Mr. Crabtree's comments and that the church should try to get other options and sees that the deterioration should not be a "deal breaker" for possible other buyers. He noted that Lyle Foster is starting an African-American Heritage Trail and its significance to the church. He asked if anyone has spoken with Lyle Foster and said that the possible buyer will place a plaque to honor the building/church.

Pastor Jack Cormack responded that they have not had contact with Lyle Foster.

Kaitlyn McConnell asked about the prospective buyers and if they are waiting on the Landmarks Board vote and how long has the church been for sale.

Pastor Jack Cormack noted that the church has been up for sale since October 2019 and the prospective new owners are waiting for the Landmarks vote and again noted that he believes that the new owners would be glad to salvage building materials.

Paden Chambers asked if the "for sale sign" has been placed on Chestnut Expressway and cannot see it when he travels on Chestnut and didn't send it.

Paster Jack Cormack stated that it has not been placed on Chestnut Expressway and has had about four dozen inquiries.

Richard Crabtree stated that is why they need a Commercial Realtor.

Paden Chambers asked if the possible buyers would be amiable for the building material to be salvaged.

Kaitlyn McConnell stated that she recommends that the church seek other options noting the difficulty but anything that could be done to save the Church is worth the effort.

Paul Lewis asked if the request for demolish can be withdrawn in light of current comments and be reconsidered.

Paden Chambers asked about staffs recommendation.

Michael Sparlin noted that staff has recommended that the applicant submit a Certificate of Economic Hardship if the board denied this request and would allow the applicant to substantiate their claim of financial hardship and this is one of three options for the applicant.

Paden Chambers noted that the building is a burden but cannot allow the demolition to go forward unless every option has been utilized.

Richard Crabtree stated that he requests that they get a Commercial Realtor to hear what can be offered and asked staff if the Board could require the applicant to get a Commercial Realtor or submit an Economic Hardship.

Michael Sparlin noted the Board can request it but they are not required to accept that option.

Richard Crabtree noted that he has seen buildings much worse in St. Louis be saved.

Kaitlyn McConnell stated if there is anything else that can be done to save this building while we have the chance, however noted that she understands the church's situation.

Richard Crabtree noted that the building will end up in the landfill and they (the church) would be the ones who tore it down, a building that survived three fires saying he would not want that on his head and would find another option.

Kent Brown noted that contacting Lyle Foster would be a good idea.

Richard Crabtree again went over the history of the building and went into the issue of the salvage regarding the cost and gave some examples of what happened in Rountree to buildings being demolished.

Ms. Ferba Lofton, 2516 E. Meadow Dr, member of the congregation told the Board members that the church will run out of insurance coverage in January 2020 and will not be renewed. She also stated to the Board members that the congregation know their history and do not need the Board to remind them of that and this burden is extremely upsetting, and the entire congregation opted to sell. She also notes the continued deterioration and problems (roof, falling brick, not accessible, homeless trashing the area, etc.) and gave out examples of problems.

Richard Crabtree stated again about getting a Commercial Realtor, not an appraiser.

Febra Lofton noted the homeless people in the area at night. She mentioned that there are no stained-glass windows and the work to the building was done by members on the church and they did the best they could do.

Paden Chambers asked if the Board could tour the building.

Ferba Lofton said yes to the tour and noted the poor condition of the building and that she and the congregation has grieved over this situation.

Richard Crabtree questioned the maintenance of the building.

Ferba Lofton stated they have an average congregation over 60 years old and falling number of members, wind damage, crumbling brick, etc. and the building has been repaired as much as they can do with the money allotted during the last tornado/storm that damaged the building.

Discussion on insurance that will not be renewed.

Richard Crabtree voiced his frustration about just finding out this predicament and advertising of the building.

Pastor Jack Cormack said that the congregation does not feel it is their mission to use all of their financial resources to maintain a building as it is to serve a community.

Richard Crabtree said that the building should have been sold earlier before this point.

Richard Crabtree stated that the church is getting its way because they allowed the church to get in the situation it is.

Paden Chambers then asked if the building was to be demolished if the Landmarks Board members can go through the building and document it.

Pater Jack Cormack said that the Landmarks members are welcome to document the building and noted that he has sent a letter to the insurance company regarding the renewal of coverage but has not heard back.

Ms. Mary Collette, Springfield, feels that there may be disconnect/lack of communication regarding what the church has done as far as advertising the building for sale. She asked if it would be possible for the item to be tabled in order to have time to get the word out to the community and other congregations.

Tom Rykowski, Assistant City Attorney noted that the applicant has the right to vote or table the certificate of appropriateness.

Pastor Jack Cormack stated that they would like to vote and get the 60-day timer going (if the board votes Nay) and noted that the congregation is willing to accept the demolition and setup/explore any procedures for any salvaging of the building material and possibly extending the insurance for approximately one month.

Richard Crabtree then noted the Landmarks Board members would like to meet with the possible new owners and see what can be done and asked if Michael Sparlin, staff to get the access setup.

Board Action

Kathleen McConnell motioned to **approve** the Certificate of Appropriateness (536 E. Tampa Street). Richard Crabtree seconded the motion. The motion carried as follows: Ayes: None. Nays: Paden Chambers (Chair), Richard Crabtree (Vice Chair), Kaitlyn McConnell, Kent Brown, and Paul Lewis. Abstain: None. Absent: Layne Hunton. **MOTION FAILED.**

Certificate of Appropriateness:

Jefferson Avenue Footbridge: Andrew Flippin, Public Works gave a presentation showing the outlines of the proposed elevators and the base bid and the alternate bid.

Paden Chambers asked about the creation of the alternate bid and the 106 process and the bicycle approach.

Andrew noted that the City does not have to do the alternate bid, however the City will also bid the alternate bid and stated that SHPO has the base bid.

Richard Crabtree stated that Option B (alternate bid) is more to the original plans/existing bridge and would to get additional/extra funds (from the public input) to get the approximate additional \$100,000.

Paden Chambers noted how close the base and the alternate bid was and asked about the vestibules on the elevators.

Spencer Jones, Great River Engineering explained about the vestibules with the elevators and noted that the elevators are not out-door elevators and will need the vestibules for heating and cooling and protecting the mechanicals.

Richard Crabtree asked if open air elevators can be explored as an option.

Andrew Flippin noted that there has been extensive review of the cost options and currently the elevators with the vestibules are the most cost effective and these options meet SHPO requirements.

Paul Lewis gave historical information regarding the bicycle approach and believes that the alternate bid is the most accurate for the rehabilitation of the bridge.

Andrew Flippin stated that the approach is not what makes it historical, that it is a transportation structure.

Paden Chambers asked about additional bids on different elevators and see many problems with regards to the vestibule, i.e., people using the heating and cooled spaces for inappropriate activities.

Paul Lewis asked if the estimates have been bided on yet.

Various Board members and City staff talked about alternatives to the design proposal and if higher long-term cost might outweigh the short-term costs in terms of savings.

Ms. Mary Collette, Springfield representing the Commercial Club as its President and prefers the alternate bid (option b) and is looking forward and agrees about the elevator vestibules and would like a better design (keeping homeless from utilizing the heated and cooled vestibules) and keeping the elevator profile as small as possible.

Landmarks Board members stated that they want most of the structure to be saved and agree to saving the bicycle approach.

Board Action

Kathleen McConnell motioned to **approve** the Certificate of Appropriateness (Jefferson Avenue Footbridge BASE BID). Richard Crabtree seconded the motion. The motion carried as follows: Ayes: None. Nays: Paden Chambers (Chair), Richard Crabtree (Vice Chair), Kaitlyn McConnell, Kent Brown, and Paul Lewis. Abstain: None. Absent: Layne Hunton. **MOTION FAILED.**

Board Action

Richard Crabtree motioned to **approve** the Certificate of Appropriateness (Jefferson Avenue Footbridge ALTERNATE BID). Richard Crabtree seconded the motion. The motion carried as follows: Ayes: Paden Chambers (Chair), Richard Crabtree (Vice Chair), Kaitlyn McConnell, Kent Brown, and Paul Lewis. Nays: None. Abstain: None. Absent: Layne Hunton.

Certified Local Government Review: None

Pre-Application Review: None

Local Historic Site Nomination Review: None

COMMUNICATIONS: Michael sent out an e-mail regarding projects coming up and clarification.

Demolition: None

Historic Site and Districts

Jefferson Avenue Footbridge: None

Potential Local Nomination: None

Design Guidelines: None

Administrative approval of C of A's.

1410 E. Walnut Street (reroof) - At the determination of City staff, the application followed the Walnut Street Design Guidelines and was approved administratively.

Any other matters that fall under the jurisdiction of the Board:

Kaitlyn McConnell commented about a historic plaque at Barry School. She asked about building decals (looks like a mural) can be used in place of murals and if City staff can investigate the details.

ADJOURNMENT:

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned.



Michael Sparlin, Senior Planner